

# Presburger formulas and Semilinear sets

## A proof of their equivalence

Rohit Kumar and Adithya Upadhyaya

UG department, IISc

# Overview

- 1 Notation
- 2 Presburger formulas
  - Formulas
  - Sets
  - Closure Properties
- 3 Semilinear sets
  - Definitions
  - Examples
  - Properties
- 4 Semilinear  $\subseteq$  Presburger
- 5 Presburger  $\subseteq$  Semilinear
- 6 References

# Notation

Corresponding operations on Presburger formulas and subsets of  $\mathbb{N}^n$ :

- $\vee$  - Conjunction and  $\cup$  - Union (finite)
- $\wedge$  - Disjunction and  $\cap$  - Intersection (finite)
- $\neg$  - Negation and  $\mathbb{N}^n - X$  - Complementation
- $\exists$  - Universal quantifier and  $\pi : \mathbb{N}^{n+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^n$  - Projection

## Partial Order on $\mathbb{N}^n$

We define a partial order on  $\mathbb{N}^n$ , denoted  $\leq$ .

Given  $a, b \in \mathbb{N}^n$ , we say  $a \leq b$  if  $a_i \leq b_i \forall 1 \leq i \leq n$ .

**Lemma:** If  $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  is such that elements in  $S$  are pairwise incomparable, then  $S$  is finite.

**Proof:** By induction on  $n$ .

# Modified Presburger formulas

## Definitions

The set of all (modified) Presburger formulas  $\mathcal{P}$  is the smallest set satisfying

- $t_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t_i x_i = t'_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t'_i x_i$ , where  $x_i$  for  $1 \leq i \leq n$  are free variables, is in  $\mathcal{P}$ .
- If  $\mathcal{P}_1$  and  $\mathcal{P}_2$  are in  $\mathcal{P}$ , then  $\mathcal{P}_1 \vee \mathcal{P}_2$  and  $\mathcal{P}_1 \wedge \mathcal{P}_2$  are also in  $\mathcal{P}$ .
- If  $\mathcal{P}$  is in  $\mathcal{P}$ ,  $\neg \mathcal{P}$  is in  $\mathcal{P}$ .
- If  $\mathcal{P}(x_1, \dots, x_n)$  is in  $\mathcal{P}$ , then  $(\exists x_i) \mathcal{P}(x_1, \dots, x_n)$  is in  $\mathcal{P}$  for  $1 \leq i \leq n$ .

# Presburger formulas

## Examples

Notice that the following formulas are also in  $\mathcal{P}$ :

- $t_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t_i x_i \leq t'_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t'_i x_i$ , equivalent to  
 $(\exists z)(z + t_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t_i x_i = t'_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t'_i x_i)$
- $(\forall x_i) \mathcal{P}(x_1, \dots, x_n)$ , equivalent to  $\neg(\exists x_i)(\neg \mathcal{P}(x_1, \dots, x_n))$ .

Some examples:

- $\mathcal{P}_1(x) = (\exists y)(x = y + 3 \wedge y < 5)$
- $\mathcal{P}_2(x, y, z) = (x + 3y = 4z + 7)$

# Presburger sets

## Definition and Examples

A set  $P$  is called a **Presburger set** in  $\mathbb{N}^n$ ,  $n > 0$  if

$P = \{ (x_1, \dots, x_n) \in \mathbb{N}^n \mid \mathcal{P}(x_1, \dots, x_n) \}$ , and we shall say the formula  $\mathcal{P}$  describes the set  $P$ .

$P$  is called a Presburger set if it is Presburger in some  $\mathbb{N}^k$ ,  $k > 0$ .

Some examples:

- $P_1 = \{3, 4, 5, 6, 7\} = \{x \in \mathbb{N} \mid \mathcal{P}_1(x)\}$
- $P_2 = \{(7 + 4b - 3a, a, b) \mid a, b \in \mathbb{N}\} = \{x \in \mathbb{N}^3 \mid \mathcal{P}_2(x)\}$

# Presburger sets

## Closure Properties

**Lemma:** Presburger sets are closed under  $\cup$ ,  $\cap$ ,  $\mathbb{N}^n - X$  and  $\pi$ .

**Proof:** Follows immediately from the definition of Presburger formulas, since the operations  $\cup$ ,  $\cap$ ,  $\mathbb{N}^n - X$  and  $\pi$  correspond to  $\vee$ ,  $\wedge$ ,  $\neg$  and  $(\exists x_i)\mathcal{P}(x_1, \dots, x_n)$  on Presburger formulas, and Presburger formulas are closed under these operations.



# Semilinear sets

## Definitions

Let  $C, P \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$ . Define  $\mathcal{L}(C; P) \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  as

$$\mathcal{L}(C; P) := \left\{ x_0 + \sum_{i=1}^k t_i x_i \mid x_0 \in C \text{ and } \forall 1 \leq i \leq k, t_i \in \mathbb{N}, x_i \in P \right\}.$$

$C$  is called the set of constants, and  $P$  the set of periods.

$L \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  is **linear** if  $L = \mathcal{L}(C; P)$  for a singleton set  $C$  and a finite set  $P$ .

$S \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  is **semilinear** if it is a finite union of linear sets, i.e.,

$$S = \bigcup_{i=1}^k \mathcal{L}(C_i; P_i) \text{ for singleton sets } C_i \text{ and finite sets } P_i.$$

# Semilinear sets

## Examples

- The set  $\mathbb{N}^n = \mathcal{L}(0^n; \{e_1, \dots, e_n\})$  is semi-linear.
- The set  $X \subseteq \mathbb{N}^2$  defined as  $X = \{(x, y) \mid x \geq 1\}$  is semi-linear as  $X = \mathcal{L}((1, 0); \{(1, 0), (0, 1)\})$
- The set  $X \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  defined by  $X = \{(a_1, \dots, a_n) \mid a_1 \text{ not divisible by } 5\}$  is semi-linear because  $X = \mathcal{L}(\{e_1, 2e_1, 3e_1, 4e_1\}; \{5e_1, e_2, \dots, e_n\})$

# Semilinear sets

## Basic Properties

### Lemma:

- 1 For  $C_1, C_2, P \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$ ,  

$$\mathcal{L}(C_1 \cup C_2; P) = \mathcal{L}(C_1; P) \cup \mathcal{L}(C_2; P)$$
- 2 For  $C, P_1, P_2 \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$ ,  

$$\mathcal{L}(\mathcal{L}(C; P_1); P_2) = \mathcal{L}(C; P_1 \cup P_2)$$
- 3 For  $C_1, P_1 \subseteq \mathbb{N}^k$  and  $C_2, P_2 \subseteq \mathbb{N}^l$ ,  

$$\mathcal{L}(C_1; P_1) \times \mathcal{L}(C_2; P_2) = \mathcal{L}(C_1 \times C_2; (P_1 \times \{0^l\}) \cup (\{0^k\} \times P_2))$$

**Proof:** Follows from the definition.

# Semilinear sets

## Basic Properties

### Corollaries:

- If  $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  is semilinear and  $P \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  is finite, then  $\mathcal{L}(S; P)$  is semilinear.

Follows by noticing that  $S = \bigcup_{i=1}^k \mathcal{L}(C_i; P_i)$  and using lemmas 1 and 2 successively.

- If  $X \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  and  $Y \subseteq \mathbb{N}^m$  are semilinear, then  $X \times Y \subseteq \mathbb{N}^{n+m}$  is semilinear.

Follows from lemma 3 because the cartesian product distributes across union.

# Semilinear sets

## Closure under Linear Maps

**Lemma:** If  $\tau : \mathbb{N}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^m$  is a linear map, and  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  is semilinear, then  $\tau(A)$  is semilinear.

**Proof:** As  $A$  is semilinear,  $A = \bigcup_{i=1}^k \mathcal{L}(C_i; P_i)$ . Then,

$$\tau(A) = \tau\left(\bigcup_{i=1}^k \mathcal{L}(C_i; P_i)\right) = \bigcup_{i=1}^k \tau(\mathcal{L}(C_i; P_i)) = \bigcup_{i=1}^k \mathcal{L}(\tau(C_i); \tau(P_i))$$

Hence,  $\tau(A)$  is semilinear.

# Semilinear sets

## Closure Properties

**Theorem:** Semilinear sets are closed under  $\cup$ ,  $\cap$ ,  $\mathbb{N}^n - X$  and  $\pi$ .

**Proof:** Semilinear sets are clearly closed under  $\cup$ , since the finite union of semilinear sets is a finite union of a finite union of linear sets, which is simply a finite union of linear sets, and is hence semilinear.

The proofs for the remaining parts of the theorem are much longer.

## Closure under Intersection

Let  $L = \mathcal{L}(x_0; \{x_1, \dots, x_p\})$ ,  $L' = \mathcal{L}(x'_0; \{x'_1, \dots, x'_q\})$  be linear sets.

Define  $A = \{(y, z) \in \mathbb{N}^{p+q} \mid x_0 + \sum_{i=1}^p y_i x_i = x'_0 + \sum_{i=1}^q z_i x'_i\}$ ,

$B = \{(y, z) \in \mathbb{N}^{p+q} \mid \sum_{i=1}^p y_i x_i = \sum_{i=1}^q z_i x'_i\}$ , and

$\tau : \mathbb{N}^{p+q} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^n$  as  $\tau(y, z) = \sum_{i=1}^p y_i x_i$ .  $\tau$  is a linear map.

## Closure under Intersection

Let  $C$  and  $P$  be the set of minimal elements in  $A$  and  $B - \{0^n\}$ .  
 These sets are finite since their elements are pairwise incomparable.  
 By arguments identical to those for basic Presburger sets, we have  
 that  $A = \mathcal{L}(C; P)$  and hence,  $A$  is semilinear.

$L \cap L' = \{x_0 + u \mid u \in \tau(A)\}$ , and hence,  $L \cap L'$  is semilinear.

Let  $X = \bigcup_{i=1}^n L_i$  and  $X' = \bigcup_{i=1}^m L'_i$  be two semilinear sets.

$X \cap X' = \bigcup_{i=1}^n \bigcup_{j=1}^m L_i \cap L_j$ , a finite union of semilinear sets, and  
 hence semilinear.



# Closure under inverses of Linear Maps

**Lemma:** If  $\tau : \mathbb{N}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^m$  is a linear map, and  $A \subseteq \mathbb{N}^m$  is semilinear, then  $\tau^{-1}(A)$  is semilinear.

**Proof:** Define  $\eta : \mathbb{N}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^{n+m}$ ,  $\eta(x) = (x, \tau(x))$ .  $\eta$  is linear. Hence,  $\eta(\mathbb{N}^n)$  is semilinear. Since  $A$  is semilinear,  $\mathbb{N}^n \times A$  is semilinear, and hence,  $K = \eta(\mathbb{N}^n) \cap (\mathbb{N}^n \times A)$  is semilinear as well. Define  $\pi : \mathbb{N}^{n+m} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^n$ ,  $\pi(x, y) = x$ .  $\pi$  is linear. Hence  $\pi(K)$  is semilinear. Note that  $\pi(K) = \tau^{-1}(A)$ , and hence,  $\tau^{-1}(A)$  is semilinear.

# Linear Independence of Periods

**Lemma:** Every linear set  $L$  can be written as the union of linear sets with linearly independent periods.

**Proof:** By induction on the number of elements in  $P$ . The statement is clearly true if  $L$  has only one period.

Assume the statement is true for linear sets with  $\leq m$  periods.

Let  $L$  have  $m + 1$  periods, i.e.,  $L = \mathcal{L}(x_0; \{x_1, \dots, x_{m+1}\})$ , and let the periods be linearly dependent. Then, by a relabelling of indices of the periods,  $\exists k, 1 \leq k \leq m$  such that for some  $a_1, \dots, a_m \in \mathbb{N}$

$$\sum_{i=1}^k a_i x_i = \sum_{i>k}^m a_i x_i$$

# Linear Independence of Periods

For each  $j > k$ , let  $C_j = \{x_0 + b_j x_j \mid 0 \leq b_j < a_j\}$  if  $a_j \geq 1$  and  $\{x_0\}$  otherwise, and  $P_j = P - \{x_j\}$ . Define  $Z_j = \mathcal{L}(C_j, P_j)$

**Claim :**  $L = \bigcup_{j>k} Z_j (= Z)$

Clearly, by definition,  $Z_j \subseteq L$  for each  $j > k$  and hence,  $Z \subseteq L$ .

Let  $y = x_0 + \sum_{i=1}^m b_i x_i$ . If  $b_j \geq a_j$  for all  $j > k$ , then

$$\begin{aligned} y &= x_0 + \sum_{i=1}^m b_i x_i + \sum_{i=1}^k a_i x_i - \sum_{i>k}^m a_i x_i \\ &= x_0 + \sum_{i=1}^k (b_i + a_i) x_i + \sum_{i>k}^m (b_i - a_i) x_i \end{aligned}$$

## Linear Independence of Periods

Thus, we can assume that  $b_j < a_j$  for some  $j > k$ . Then,  
 $y = x_0 + b_j x_j + \sum_{i \neq j} b_i x_i \in Z_j$  and hence,  $L \subseteq Z$ , giving  $L = Z$ . Now  
 each  $Z_j$  has  $\leq m$  periods and by the induction hypothesis, can be  
 written as a union of sets with linearly independent periods.  
 Hence,  $L$  can be written as a union of sets with linearly  
 independent periods and the lemma follows.

# Span of a Basis

**Definition:** Given  $\{x_1, \dots, x_k\} \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$ ,

$$\text{span}_{\mathbb{Z}}\{x_1, \dots, x_k\} = \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^k a_i x_i \mid a_i \in \mathbb{Z} \forall 1 \leq i \leq k \right\}$$

**Lemma:** Let  $\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$  be a set of linearly independent vectors in  $\mathbb{N}^n$ . Then,  $\exists k_0 \in \mathbb{N}^n$  such that  $\forall y \in \mathbb{N}^n$ ,  $\exists k$  such that  $ky \in \text{span}_{\mathbb{Z}}\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$  and  $1 \leq k \leq k_0$ .

**Proof:** It is enough to show that for each  $e_i = (0, \dots, 0, 1, 0 \dots 0)$  (1 at the  $i$ th coordinate),  $\exists k_i$  such that  $k_i e_i \in \text{span}_{\mathbb{Z}}\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$ . We show this for  $i = 1$ , as the same proof works for all  $i$ 's. Let  $\pi : \mathbb{N}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^{n-1}$  be the projection onto the last  $n - 1$  coordinates.  $\pi$  is linear.

## Span of a Basis

$\{\pi(x_1), \dots, \pi(x_n)\} \subseteq \mathbb{N}^{n-1} \subseteq \mathbb{Q}^{n-1}$ . This is a set of  $n$  vectors in a vector space of dimension  $n - 1$ , and is hence linearly dependent.

Hence  $\sum_{i=1}^n q_i \pi(x_i) = 0$  for some  $\{q_i\}$ , with atleast one non-zero  $q_i$ .

Clearing denominators, we get  $\sum_{i=1}^n r_i \pi(x_i) = 0$ , where  $\{r_i\} \subseteq \mathbb{Z}^{n-1}$ .

$$\sum_{i=1}^n r_i \pi(x_i) = \pi\left(\sum_{i=1}^n r_i x_i\right) = 0 \implies \sum_{i=1}^n r_i x_i = (k_1, 0, \dots, 0).$$

As the  $x_i$ 's are linearly independent,  $k_1 \neq 0$ .

Thus,  $k_1 e_1 \in \text{span}_{\mathbb{Z}}\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$ .

## Span of a Basis

**Lemma:** Let  $\{x_1, \dots, x_n\} \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  be a set of linearly independent vectors and  $y \in \mathbb{N}^n$ . Let  $k_y$  denote the smallest  $k$  such that

$$ky \in \text{span}_{\mathbb{Z}}\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}. \text{ Let } ky = \sum_{i=1}^n a_i x_i \text{ and } ky = \sum_{i=1}^n b_i x_i.$$

Then,  $\exists p \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $k = pk_y$  and  $b_i = pa_i$ .

**Proof:** Let  $k = pk_y + r$ , with  $r < k_y$ . Then,  $ry = \sum_{i=1}^n (b_i - pa_i)x_i$ .

Hence,  $ry \in \text{span}_{\mathbb{Z}}\{x_1, \dots, x_n\}$ , giving  $r = 0$ .

The linear independence of  $\{x_i\}$  gives  $b_i - pa_i = 0 \quad \forall 1 \leq i \leq n$ .

# Closure under Complements

**Lemma:** let  $L = \mathcal{L}(0^n; \{x_1, \dots, x_{j_0}\})$  be a linear subset of  $\mathbb{N}^n$  with independent periods. Then  $\mathbb{N}^n - L$  is semilinear.

**Proof:** Let  $P = \{x_1, \dots, x_{j_0}\}$  be the set of independent periods of the  $X$ . Adjoin  $n - j_0$  of the  $e_i$ 's to  $P$  to get  $n$  linearly independent vectors in  $\mathbb{N}^n$ . Let  $k_0$  be as in the previous lemma.



## Closure under Complements

Define the following sets:

- $G_1 = \{y \in \mathbb{N}^n \mid k_y y = \sum_{i=1}^n a_i x_i \Rightarrow \exists i \text{ such that } a_i < 0\}$  and

$$H_1 = \mathbb{N}^n - G_1$$

- $G_2 = \{y \in \mathbb{N}^n \mid k_y y = \sum_{i=1}^n a_i x_i \Rightarrow \exists i > j \text{ such that } a_i > 0\}$

$$\text{and } H_2 = H_1 - G_2$$

Note that both  $G_1, G_2 \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n - L$ . Hence,

$$\begin{aligned}
 \mathbb{N}^n - L &= (G_1 \cup G_2) \cup ((\mathbb{N}^n - (G_1 \cup G_2)) - L) \\
 &= G_1 \cup G_2 \cup ((H_1 - G_2) - L) = G_1 \cup G_2 \cup (H_2 - L).
 \end{aligned}$$

Hence, to show that  $\mathbb{N}^n - L$  is semilinear, it suffices to show that  $G_1, G_2$  and  $H_2 - L$  are semilinear.

## Closure under Complements

Define the following linear maps:

- For  $1 \leq k \leq k_0$  and  $I \subseteq \{1, \dots, n\}$ , define  

$$\tau_{k,I} : \mathbb{N}^n \times \mathbb{N}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^n \times \mathbb{N}^n, \tau_{k,I}(y, a) = (ky + \sum_{i \in I} a_i x_i, \sum_{i \notin I} a_i x_i)$$
- $\pi : \mathbb{N}^n \times \mathbb{N}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^n, \pi(x, y) = x$

Define the following subsets of  $\mathbb{N}^n \times \mathbb{N}^n$ :

- $K = \{(y, y) \mid y \in \mathbb{N}^n\}$ . Let  $T : \mathbb{N}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{N}^n \times \mathbb{N}^n, T(y) = (y, y)$ . Then  $T$  is linear, and  $K = T(\mathbb{N}^n)$  and is hence semilinear.
- $D_i = \{(y, a) \mid a_i > 0\}$ .  $D_i = \mathcal{L}(e_{n+i}; \{e_1, \dots, e_{2n}\})$  and hence,  $D_i$  is semilinear.
- $A_I = \{(y, a) \mid a_i > 0 \forall i \in I\}$ .  $A_I = \mathcal{L}(\sum_{i \in I} e_{n+i}; \{e_1, \dots, e_{2n}\})$  and hence,  $A_I$  is semilinear.

## Closure under Complements

First, we show  $G_1$  is semilinear.

$\tau_{k,l}^{-1}(K)$  and  $A_l$  are semilinear, thus  $\tau_{k,l}^{-1}(K) \cap A_l$  is semi-linear, and  $\pi(\tau_{k,l}^{-1}(K) \cap A_l)$  is semilinear as well.

$G_1 = \bigcup_{k \leq k_0} \bigcup_{l \neq \emptyset} \pi(\tau_{k,l}^{-1}(K) \cap A_l)$  and hence,  $G_1$  is semilinear.

Next, we show  $G_2$  is semilinear.

$D_i$  is semilinear, thus  $D_i \cap \tau_{k,l}^{-1}(K) \cap A_l$  is semi-linear, and  $\pi(D_i \cap \tau_{k,l}^{-1}(K) \cap A_l)$  is semilinear as well.

$G_2 = \bigcup_{i > j_0} \bigcup_{I \subseteq \{1, \dots, n\} - \{i\}} \bigcup_{k \leq k_0} \pi(D_i \cap A_I \cap \tau_{k,l}^{-1}(K))$  and hence,  $G_2$  is semilinear.

## Closure under Complements

It remains to prove  $H_2 - L$  is semilinear.

For  $k \leq k_0$  and  $j \leq j_0$ , define

$$B_{kj} = \{(y, b) \in \mathbb{N}^n \times \mathbb{N}^{j_0} \mid k_y y = \sum_{i=1}^j a_i x_i, a_j \text{ not divisible by } k_y\}.$$

Define  $E_k = \{(y, a) \in \mathbb{N}^n \times \mathbb{N}^{j_0} \mid k_y y = \sum_{i=1}^j b_i x_i\}$  and

$F_{kj} = \{(y, b) \mid b_j \text{ is not divisible by } k\}$ .  $E_k$  and  $F_{kj}$  are semilinear.

Also,  $B_{kj} = E_k \cap F_{kj}$  and thus  $B_{kj}$  is semilinear. Now,

$H_2 - X = \bigcup_{j \leq j_0} \bigcup_{k \leq k_0} \pi(B_{kj})$ . Hence,  $H_2 - L$  is semi-linear and thus

we are done.

## Closure under Complements

**Lemma:** let  $L \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  be a linear subset with independent periods. Then  $\mathbb{N}^n - L$  is semi-linear.

**Proof:** Let  $L = \mathcal{L}(x_0; \{x_1, \dots, x_k\})$  with  $k \leq n$ .

For each  $i$  such that  $(x_0)_i > 0$ , define  $C_i = \{(u_1, \dots, u_n) \mid u_i = 0 \text{ for } j \neq i \text{ and } 0 \leq u_j < (x_0)_j\}$  and  $P_i = \{e_1, \dots, e_{i-1}, e_{i+1}, \dots, e_n\}$ .

Then,  $Z_i = L(C_i; P_i)$  is semilinear and  $G = \bigcup_{(x_0)_i > 0} Z_i$  is the set of

all elements in  $\mathbb{N}^n$  such that  $y \geq x_0$  is false. Thus,  $G \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n - L$ .

Let  $Y = \{y \in \mathbb{N}^n \mid x_0 \leq y\}$ .  $Y = \mathbb{N}^n - G$ , and hence,

$\mathbb{N}^n - L = G \cup (\mathbb{N}^n - L - G) = G \cup (Y - L)$ .

## Closure under Complements

Now, we show  $Y - L$  is semilinear.

Define  $f : \mathbb{N}^n \rightarrow Y$ ,  $f(y) = y + x_0$ . Note that

$f(\mathcal{L}(C; P)) = \mathcal{L}(f(C); P)$  and hence,  $Z$  is semilinear  $\Rightarrow f(Z)$  is semilinear. We have that

$$f^{-1}(Y - L) = f^{-1}(Y) - f^{-1}(L) = \mathbb{N}^n - f^{-1}(L).$$

$f^{-1}(L) = L(0^n; \{x_1, \dots, x_n\})$  and thus  $\mathbb{N}^n - f^{-1}(L)$  is semilinear by the previous lemma. Since  $Y - L \subseteq f(\mathbb{N}^n)$ ,  
 $Y - L = f(f^{-1}(Y - L))$ , and hence,  $Y - L$  is semilinear.

# Closure under Complements

**Theorem:** Let  $Y \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  be a semilinear subset. Then  $\mathbb{N}^n - Y$  is a semilinear subset of  $\mathbb{N}^n$ .

**Proof:** It is enough to consider the case when  $Y$  is linear. By the lemma on independent periods,  $Y = \bigcup_{i=1}^m Z_i$  with each  $Z_i$  being linear with independent periods. Then,  $\mathbb{N}^n - Y = \bigcap_{i=1}^m (\mathbb{N}^n - Z_i)$ . By the previous lemma, each  $\mathbb{N}^n - Z_i$  is semilinear, and the intersection of semilinear sets is semilinear. Hence,  $\mathbb{N}^n - Y$  is semilinear.

## Semilinear sets are Presburger sets

We will now show that every Semilinear set is Presburger.

Let  $L \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  be linear. Then,  $L = \mathcal{L}(v_0; \{v_1, \dots, v_k\})$ .

Let  $v_{ij}$ ,  $0 \leq i \leq k, 1 \leq j \leq n$  denote the  $j^{\text{th}}$  coordinate of  $v_i$ .

Define  $\mathcal{P}_L(x_1, \dots, x_n) := (\exists a_1) \dots (\exists a_k) \left( \bigwedge_{j=1}^n (x_j = v_{0j} + \sum_{i=1}^k a_i v_{ij}) \right)$

$\mathcal{P}_L$  describes  $L$ , and hence  $L$  is a Presburger set.

If  $S$  is semilinear, then  $S = \bigcup_{i=1}^k L_i$  for linear sets  $L_i$ .

Define  $\mathcal{P}_S := \bigvee_{i=1}^k \mathcal{P}_{L_i}$ , and  $\mathcal{P}_S$  describes  $S$ .



# Presburger Sets are Semilinear Sets

## Outline of proof

We will now show that every Presburger set is Semilinear.

We call a Presburger set  $B \subseteq \mathbb{N}^n$  a *basic* Presburger set if  $B$  is described by a Presburger formula  $\mathcal{P}$ , where

$$\mathcal{P} = \left( t_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t_i x_i = t'_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t'_i x_i \right).$$

We show that basic Presburger sets are semilinear. All Presburger sets are obtained through operations  $\cup$ ,  $\cap$ ,  $\mathbb{N}^n - X$  and  $\pi$  on basic Presburger sets, and since semilinear sets are closed under  $\cup$ ,  $\cap$ ,  $\mathbb{N}^n - X$  and  $\pi$ , all Presburger sets are semilinear.

## Basic Presburger sets are Semilinear

Let  $B$  be a basic Presburger set described by

$$\mathcal{P} = \left( t_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t_i x_i = t'_0 + \sum_{i=1}^n t'_i x_i \right).$$

Let  $\mathcal{P}'$  be the corresponding homogeneous formula,

$$\mathcal{P}' = \left( \sum_{i=1}^n t_i x_i = \sum_{i=1}^n t'_i x_i \right)$$

Let  $C$  be the set of minimal solutions to  $\mathcal{P}$  and  $P$  be the set of minimal solutions to  $\mathcal{P}'$  in  $\mathbb{N}^n - \{0^n\}$ .  $C$  and  $P$  are finite, since their elements are pairwise incomparable.

## Basic Presburger sets are Semilinear

**Claim:**  $B = \mathcal{L}(C; P)$  and hence,  $B$  is semilinear.

**Proof:** Solutions to  $\mathcal{P}'$  are closed under addition, and if  $v$  solves  $\mathcal{P}$  and  $u$  solves  $\mathcal{P}'$ ,  $v + u$  solves  $\mathcal{P}$ . Hence,  $\mathcal{L}(C; P) \subseteq B$ .

Now, assume  $v$  solves  $\mathcal{P}$ . Then  $\exists v' \in C$  such that  $v' \leq v$ .

Further,  $v - v'$  solves  $\mathcal{P}'$ . We show that any solution of  $\mathcal{P}'$  is in  $\mathcal{L}(0^n; P)$ , and hence  $B \subseteq \mathcal{L}(C; P)$ .

## Basic Presburger sets are Semilinear

Let  $v \in \mathbb{N}^n$  solve  $\mathcal{P}'$ . We show that  $v \in \mathcal{L}(0^n; P)$ .

The proof is by induction on  $s = \sum_{i=1}^n v_i$ .

For  $s = 0$ ,  $0^n \in \mathcal{L}(0^n; P)$ .

Assume that for  $s \leq k$ ,  $v$  solves  $\mathcal{P}' \Rightarrow v \in \mathcal{L}(0^n; P)$ .

Let  $v$  be such that  $s = k + 1$ . Then,  $\exists v' \in P$  such that  $v' \leq v$ ,  $v' \neq 0^n$ . Then  $v - v'$  has  $s \leq k$  and solves  $\mathcal{P}'$ , and hence,  $v - v' \in \mathcal{L}(0^n; P)$ . Hence,  $v \in \mathcal{L}(0^n; P)$  as well.

This completes the proof of equivalence of Semilinear sets and Presburger sets.

## References

- 1 Ginsburg, Seymour; Spanier, Edwin H. “Bounded Algol-Like Languages.” Transactions of the American Mathematical Society, vol. 113, no. 2, 1964, pp. 333–368.
- 2 Ginsburg, Seymour; Spanier, Edwin H. “Semigroups, Presburger formulas, and languages”. Pacific J. Math. 16 (1966), no. 2, 285-296.